

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
October 2nd, 2019

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, October 2nd, 2019 at 7:00 pm at 98 Washington Street, Salem, MA. Present were David Harte, Reed Cutting, Erin Schafer, Stacey Norkum, Vijay Joyce and Milo Martinez. Absent were Larry Spang, Rebecca English and Mark Pattison.

6 Federal Court - continuation

Federal Court Realty Trust submitted an application for a Certificate of Hardship to demolish carriage house

Ms. Kelleher noted that at the last meeting the applicant had asked for a continuation to the October 16th meeting.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the continuation. Ms. Norkum seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

122 Derby Street - continuation

Robert Burkinshaw submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement.

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant requested a continuation to the October 16th meeting.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the continuation. Ms. Norkum seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

28 Chestnut Street - continuation

Andrew Lippman and Annie C. Harris, Trustees submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for architectural roof shingles.

Ms. Kelleher presented the owners' request to withdraw.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the withdrawal without prejudice. Ms. Norkum seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

262 Lafayette Street

Bates House Condominium Trust submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace gutters.

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicants have requested to withdraw their application.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the application withdrawal without prejudice. Ms. Norkum seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

1 Forrester Street

Jennifer Geraghty submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new fencing.

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant has requested to withdraw her application.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the application withdrawal without prejudice. Ms. Norkum seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

110 Federal Street Unit #3

Linda Clifford and Patricia Barry submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new HVAC mini split system.

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicants have requested to continue to the October 16th meeting.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the continuation to the October 16, 2019 meeting. Ms. Norkum seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

11 Warren Street Units 1 and 2 – continuation

Patricia Nagle/Christopher and Karen Nagle submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install an AC unit and a HVAC mini-split system.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 8/19/19
- Photographs

Christopher Nagle and Patricia Nagle were present.

Mr. Nagle and Ms. Nagle presented the application with drawings to indicate where the unit would be positioned. Mr. Nagle explained that two systems were to be installed, one for each unit. The system for unit 1, which is further from the street, will run snugly beside a drainpipe with vegetation below to obscure the HVAC condenser unit. He referred to drawing 3 in the application that shows the compressor and explained that it is 3 feet high and elevated on a concrete slab in a box which is obscured by more vegetation. For the HVAC system for Unit 2, Mr. Nagle said the pipes for this unit will be internal and run through a closet based on the recommendation of the Commission at the last meeting. He went on to explain that a picket fence 49” high will be installed per the Board’s approval. Mr. Hart asked about visibility of the compressor and drainpipe. Ms. Schafer asked about the location of the pipe. Mr. Nagle said the HVAC pipe would fit snugly next to the drainpipe and this pipe is further from the street. Mr. Martinez thanked the homeowners for revising their plans to respond to the Commission’s suggestions. Ms. Nagle said they would decide as to whether they would install a fence or shrubbery at a later date.

Mr. Hart asked for public comment; there was none.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to approve the installation of both units with the exterior pipe to be painted to match the house color. Once the condenser is installed, the Commission will review visibility of the condenser units to determine if additional screening is necessary. Ms. Norkum seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

42 Warren Street

William J. Durkin and Abby Elizabeth Conway submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a radon mitigation system.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 8/19/19
- Photographs
- Radon system brochure

William Durkin and Abby Elizabeth Conway were present.

Mr. Durkin said they bought the property this past Summer and had a Radon test which uncovered high levels of Radon that exceed EPA safety levels. He explained that Radon is a known carcinogen. Mr. Durkin said he consulted with a firm that deals in Radon mitigation systems and they recommended an exterior system with a fan at the base of the house and a pipe running up to and past the roofline. Mr. Joyce asked if the pipe would run alongside the gutter and would it be in front or behind the gutter. Mr. Durkin believes it is behind the gutter, but he would check. Mr. Cutting said if possible, he would prefer the pipe to be between the downspout and corner trim. Mr. Durkin agreed. Mr. Hart asked about the size of the fan and said he would like to view it after installation. Mr. Durkin said the fan was smaller than an A/C unit and would be behind an existing fence.

Mr. Hart asked for public comment; there was none.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the application with the pipe preferably going behind the downspout and painted to match the house color and trim. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

192 Federal Street

Pamela Waldron submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to restore cornice details and install architectural roof shingles.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 9/17/19
- Photographs

Pamela Waldron was present.

The Board thanked Ms. Waldron for restoring the house and removing the shingles. Ms. Waldron said she would like to replace the existing 3tab roof shingles with GAF Slateline architectural shingles similar to the house at 153 Federal Street. She believes they are a much better source of wind protection and although a little more expensive she felt they were worth it. Mr. Hart asked for the shingle color. Ms. Waldron replied English grey. She explained that the roofline would be extended slightly to recreate the cornice line and that new corbels will be installed to match existing corbels on the house. Mr. Martinez asked her to explain in further detail the extension of the roofline and Ms. Waldron said she was bringing it down to meet the roof on the other side. Mr. Joyce explained that historically there would have been a wood gutter there and Ms. Waldron said yes, but when they added the gutter it appears that the removed corbels.

Mr. Hart asked for public comment; there was none.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to approve the application for GAF Slateline architectural shingles in English grey and to recreate corbels and fascia moldings. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

0 North Pine Street

Jamie and Dan Graham submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to alter window.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 9/16/19
- Photographs
- Elevation drawings

Jamie and Dan Graham were present.

Ms. Graham explained that they were in the process of extensive interior renovations that have triggered building and safety code compliance. She said that the current half moon window in the gable needs to be replaced with a larger window since it is too small to provide egress. She said the overall plan is to replace four windows, two will be in-kind and one is not visible from a public way. She said she would like feedback from the Board on the type and style window for the gable. Mr. Graham produced three options, the first being to replace in-kind half moon with a 5x8" casement window below. The second option is to keep the arch with the half moon window being inoperable and the third option would be to remove the half moon and install a rectangular double-hung window. Mr. Hart asked about elevation plans and the other windows. Ms. Graham explained that the bay window on the rear of the building will be replaced in-kind as it is not required for egress and will consist of a pine construct. Ms. Norkum asked what the trim would look like for option two as it would be visible from the street. She added that option two was her least preferable. Ms. Graham said that the windows would be custom made. Mr. Cutting asked if the half moon would be a smaller version in option two, Ms. Graham replied yes and said that all of the windows need to be reframed. Ms. Norkum, Ms. Shafer and Mr. Martinez said they would be more inclined to select option three (double hung) as this would be closer to the original design of the building. Ms. Graham presented window options from the window manufacturer and the Board overall felt that an Ellipse-segmented arched top double hung was the best option. Mr. Joyce recommended a six over six window to match the glass size.

Mr. Hart asked for public comment; there was none.

Mr. Hart went on to suggest that the applicants return to the October 16th meeting and bring shop drawings showing profiles of muntins and trim.

VOTE: Ms. Norkum made a motion to continue to the next meeting and requested the Applicant bring cut sheets and drawings of the arched top. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

11 Cambridge Street

Steven and Julie Colby submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new gutter.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 9/17/19
- Photographs

Steven and Julie Colby were present.

Mr. Colby explained that they would like to replace the existing damaged aluminum gutter on the driveway side of house and replace it in-kind. On the neighbor's driveway side of the house, they would like to install a new gutter to prevent the water run off as this water is flooding the basement. This gutter would match the existing aluminum gutters on the house and would be painted the same color. The gutter is a K-style. The downspout for the new gutter would be at the back of the house. Mr. Cutting asked what the Historical Commission policy was on gutters and Ms. Kelleher said the Commission has approved aluminum gutters if the house currently has aluminum. Mr. Joyce asked if the gutters would be painted in kind and Ms. Colby replied yes.

Mr. Hart asked for public comment; there was none.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to approve the application as submitted to match material and color of existing gutters. New gutter to have no downspout but will expel water to existing gutter system on rear ell. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.

39-41 Washington Street – Request for reconsideration of earlier approval

Jeremy Peterson was present. Mr. Peterson received a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing slate roof with new GAF Slateline architectural shingles with the condition that the slate be retained on the dormer roofs and side walls. Mr. Peterson reported that when the slate was removed, the roofer found an underlayer of wood shingles that has scorch marks that may be from the 1914 Salem fire. As a result of the multiple layers of slate and wood shingles on the roof, the slate is extremely deteriorated and is unusable. He said he would like some guidance on the matter. Mr. Joyce recommended using slate on the dormers as anything else would be very noticeable. Mr. Peterson mentioned that he had some slate left over from the roof that he could use on the dormers. The Commission agreed that this remained the best solution.

27 Herbert Street - continuation

Nancy Corral submitted an application for a Certificate of Hardship for a new metal fence and gate after the fact.

Miss Kelleher reported that the owner lives primarily out of state and has been unable to attend a meeting. She recommended that due to the time limit for review of the application, the Commission deny the request without prejudice until such time as Ms. Corral is able to attend a meeting.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a move to deny the request without prejudice until such time applicant or a representative is able to attend a meeting. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Community Preservation Plan – request for comment.

Ms. Kelleher explained that the City puts together a preservation plan each year for its CPA funding, including recommendations for certain projects that need attention. As part of this plan, the City asks for public comment. In the past the Commission has provided comment relating to historic preservation-related CPA funding. She provided the FY19 comment letter as an example, which highlighted the restoration of the Nathaniel Hawthorne statue and the replacement of the wood shingle roof at the Turner Ingersoll Mansion. She asked the Board to think about any projects that they would like to recommend for funding in FY20. Mr. Hart suggested they review previous letters of request. Ms. Shafer commented that Collins Cove looks really good and that they should continue being advocates for preserving historic sites including landscapes. Ms. Kelleher said she would draft a letter for the Board to review. She also suggested a CPA focus regarding climate change impacts on historic sites. The public meeting for the CPA Plan is scheduled for October 8th and comments are due by the end of October.

Other Business

YMCA:

Ms. Kelleher informed the Board that a letter had been sent to the YMCA in relation to the request for the transom window and trim to be restored. She said she is waiting on a response.

6 Federal Court: Ms. Kelleher explained that she had reached out twice to the owner's Attorney to schedule a time to meet with him and the owner to discuss options, but she has not heard back. She will keep the Board informed.

42 Broad Street

Ms. Norkum said that although the Board had approved Harvey windows for the house, the owners have put them in an aluminum clad finish and look terrible. Ms. Kelleher said she would take some pictures and report back.

Violations

Orne Square

Ms. Kelleher notified the Board that despite correspondence requesting, the owners have not yet fixed fence. She would keep them updated.

Adjournment: 9:25PM

Motion: Mr. Cutting made a motion to adjourn and Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All were in favor; and so, the motion carried.