

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
August 5, 2015

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, August 5, 2015 at 7:00 pm at 120 Washington Street, Salem, MA. Present were Jessica Herbert (Chair), Kathy Harper (Vice Chair), Laurie Bellin, Reed Cutting, David Hart, Susan Keenan, and Joanne McCrea.

161 Federal Street

As a continuation from a previous meeting, on behalf of Dan Botwinik/161 Federal Street, LLC, Epsilon Associates, Inc. submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for improvements to the former Saint James Rectory, including renovations associated with a new residential use. The project will include repairing and repainting (same colors as existing) the exterior wood clapboard siding, retaining and repairing the existing wood windows and doors and replacing missing or damaged slates from the roof with in-kind materials. A new roof dormer will be added to the rear (south) slope of the hip roof to provide adequate clearance at the attic level.

Review of the roof dormer was continued until the applicant was able to appear before the Zoning Board of Appeals.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application submitted 4/21/15
- Photographs
- Ganek Architects, Inc. drawings dated 4/17/15

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.

95 Federal Street

As a continuation from a previous meeting, Robert Kendall submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all the existing wooden gutters, including the porches, with 6" aluminum gutters pre-painted with an Ivory finish to closely match the existing trim color.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 6/22/15
- Photographs
- Estimate from New England Gutter Kings

VOTE: Ms. Turiel made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.

89 Federal Street

As a continuation from a previous meeting, T. Jane Graham-Dwyer submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing roof with architectural shingles.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 6/25/15
- Photographs

VOTE: *Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

31 Broad Street

As a continuation from a previous meeting, Brian Boches submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the porch as needed with similar products.

The application was continued to provide the applicant time to submit additional details on the proposed changes to the porch.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 6/29/2015
- Photographs

VOTE: *Mr. Hart made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

126 ½ Federal Street

Joy Marchand Davis submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace an existing wooden gutter with a fiberglass gutter of similar appearance and color. Approximately 6-8ft of gutter will be replaced. One foot of the new gutter will be visible from the public way. The remaining gutters on that side of the house have already been replaced with fiberglass gutters.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/8/15
- Photographs: 7/8/15

VOTE: *Ms. Turiel made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

13 Chestnut Street

As a continuation from a previous meeting, Nicholas & Jennifer Kiefer submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to change the exterior paint color of the house and garage. The applicants consulted with Historic New England's Senior Manager of Historic Preservation Services, Sally Zimmerman, to ensure that the selected colors are historically appropriate. The proposed paint colors are:

Body: Benjamin Moore Amherst Gray
Trim: Navajo White

House and garage doors: Fine Paints of Europe Delft Blue
Window sashes/grills: Black

Approval of the garage door color was continued from May 20, 2015 meeting, so that the Commission could view a sample of the color.

Nicholas and Jennifer Kiefer were present.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application submitted 4/23/15
- Photographs
- Paint chips
- Proposal from Cosmos Painting Company

Ms. Kiefer summarized that the Commission members visited the house last night to view the garage door paint color sample. She pointed out that while the property is across the street from Hamilton Hall, the garage is not visible. Additionally, there are several other houses in the McIntire District that also have garage doors painted to match the front doors.

Mr. Kiefer stated that Sally Zimmerman, from Historic New England, stated that it is in keeping with the period of the house to paint garage doors the same color as the house doors. Doing so keeps the garage doors from standing out less, despite the more modern practice of having the doors be a different color.

Julie Colby, 11 Cambridge Street, spoke in support of the application.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to close the public hearing. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.

Ms. Keenan stated that she liked the color.

Ms. Bellin stated that she has issues with the paint color, however the house door colors were already approved. She feels the blue doesn't quite coordinate with the house color. The garage door is not in the same plane as the front doors, so it blending in with the house does not hold the same validity. She would prefer the garage door be painted the color of the house.

Mr. Hart stated that the color has been vetted by Sally Zimmerman who is a paint expert. He has no issue with the color.

Mr. Spang commended the applicants for their work on the house. He stated that color is a very personal choice so he tries to look at just the appropriateness of it. He stated that an expert has recommended the color and with the history of the house it works.

Ms. McCrea stated the house looks beautiful and she appreciates the research the applicants put into the selection.

Ms. Turiel and Mr. Cutting were also in support of the color.

VOTE: *Ms. McCrea made a motion to approve the application, as submitted. Ms. Turiel seconded the motion. Ms. Herbert, Ms. Harper, Mr. Cutting, Mr. Hart, Ms. Keenan, and Ms. McCrea were in favor. Ms. Bellin was opposed, and the motion so carried.*

53 Summer Street

As a continuation from a previous meeting, Chris and Stacey Norkun submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all 27 windows and exterior trim frames on the house. The current windows are in a state of extreme rot and deterioration which requires full replacements. Install all-wood sash, trim and frames to copy original. Incorporate modern energy-saving features like hidden weather tripping and jamb liners. Window sizes and grill types to match the existing. The exterior trim & frame will be painted off-white. The exterior mullions and sashes will be painted black or dark green.

The proposed windows are Marvin Ultimate.

Chris Norkum was present.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 6/15/2015
- Photographs

Mr. Norkum presented the samples for the proposed windows. They found that the original windows were replaced with Brosco windows. The sills were historical but have completely rotted. The proposed Pella window is 100% wood, simulated divided light, with a custom wooden frame and 2" sills. If they paint the muntins black, they believe it will hide the simulated divided light. The windows will be 6/6. The muntin would be 5/8".

Mr. Hart stated that a thicker muntin would be more appropriate for their style of house.

Mr. Cutting asked if the Commission has approved 27 simulated divided light windows for a house in the past.

Ms. Herbert responded that the Marvin Ultimate window has been approved in the past. It has been 9-10 years since the Commission has approved this type of window.

Mr. Hart stated that a property of Winter Street has received approval for a large number of window replacements.

Mr. Cutting stated that the simulated divided light windows do give a different look and this house is right at the street. He also questioned the longevity of the windows.

Mr. Hart stated that he would prefer to see a true divided light with a storm window.

Mr. Norkum stated that true divided light windows are double the cost.

Mr. Spang clarified that the double glazed true divided light is more expensive, however the single glazed true divided light with storm typically costs less. He questioned whether the storms

on the front of the window look better than the simulated divided light. He sees no reason to approve the window if it was approved in the past.

Ms. Herbert stated that the Guidelines list the windows as one of the previously approved windows. She added that the Joseph Story house has insulated glass windows approved by the Commission, along with the Carriage House along the Common.

Ms. Bellin stated that current windows are Brosco true divided light. She questioned the details of the Certificates.

There was no public comment.

VOTE: *Ms. Bellin made a motion to close the public hearing. Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

Mr. Hart stated that the guidelines list these windows as potentially acceptable and they have approved the windows before. He recommended to the applicant that they investigate a single glazed true divided light window with an exterior or interior storm, even if the commission approved the double-glazed window.

John Wang Bedell, 6 Cambridge Street, stated that several years ago they installed single-glazed true-divided light window with Energy Sash.

MOTION: *Ms. Kennan made a motion to approve the application, as presented. Mr. Spang seconded the motion.*

Ms. Bellin stated that the muntin width needs to be clarified. She asked whether the motion should be voted on tonight, given Mr. Harts comments that the applicants should investigate single-glazed window.

Ms. Herbert stated that the motion could be amended to include an option.

Mr. Norkun measured the widths of the muntin on the sample window. It was 7/8".

VOTE: *Mr. Hart made a motion to amend the previous motion to state that the muntin be 7/8" wide and that the applicant have the option to install a true-divided light wood sash with a 7/8" muntin and an exterior storm window or and interior Energy Sash. Ms. Turiel seconded the amended motion. Ms. Herbert, Ms. Harper, Ms. Bellin, Mr. Hart, Ms. Kennan, and Ms. McCrea were in favor. Mr. Cutting was opposed. The motion so carried.*

20 Warren Street

Dan Randall & Phil Gillespie submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the garage doors with Clingerman custom wood overhead doors. The doors would be constructed out of Mahogany and would have an overall thickness of 3".

Peter Strout, Strout Construction, was present.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 6/29/2015
- Photographs
- Estimate from Salem Overhead Door Co. Inc.
- Specification sheet from Clingerman Doors
- Clingerman brochure

Mr. Strout stated the doors will be different than the existing doors but the style will be similar to that of the gates. The doors will be custom made. There is tongue and groove into between the stiles. The owners also want the doors to be insulated because there is a residence above and there have been issues with pipes freezing in the building. The doors will be constructed out of 3" thick mahogany. The windows will be insulated true-divided light. The doors will be painted the same color as the shutters and the gates, Essex Green.

Mr. Spang asked if the door rolls up but is intended to look as though it opens like a carriage house door.

Mr. Strout responded in the affirmative.

Mr. Strout added that the styles and rails will be proud. The tongue and groove panels will be recessed.

There was no public comment.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to close the public hearing. Ms. Kennan seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.

Mr. Spang asked if the applicants would consider staining the doors.

Mr. Strout responded that the owners would like the doors painted to match the trim and fence.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the application, as submitted. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.

6 Cambridge Street

John Wang Bedell submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a greenhouse structure adjacent to his fence along Cambridge Street.

John Wang Bedell was present.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/16/15
- Photographs: 7/16/15

Mr. Wang Bedell stated that the roof would be a shallow hip roof because the slope roof would be too tall. Only the peak of the roof would be visible over the fence. There will be glass doors

and windows on the side, but you will not be able to see them. The structure would be 8' at the crest of the roof.

Ms. Herbert asked if the shingles would be 3-tab shingles.

Mr. Wang Bedell stated that it would be similar. They are considering architectural shingles. He was considering painted the shed the same color scheme as the house trim and body, however painting it entirely red is also an option. He added that they will only be installing storm windows at this time.

Mr. Spang asked the purpose of the shed and the footprint.

Mr. Wang Bedell responded that it will be part greenhouse, part summer studio. The footprint of the shed is 6' wide by 9' long.

Mr. Spang asked for clarification of the top of the fence and the visibility of the storms.

Mr. Wang Bedell responded that the structure will be visible through the lattice top of the fence. There will be smaller windows around the top of the shed that will also be visible through the lattice.

Ms. McCrea asked if the neighbors were in support of the application.

Michael Shelps, 329 Essex Street, spoke in support of the application.

Ms. Herbert questioned whether the shed should be set back from the fence rather than right against the fence where it would seem like an appendage of the fence.

Mr. Wang Bedell responded that it will intrude into the patio and would throw off the symmetry of the fence.

Ms. Herbert stated that the basement size roof windows along the balustrade of the fence may look strange.

Mr. Hart stated that he has an issue with the shed being located along the street.

Mr. Spang asked about the possibility of the shed being located elsewhere on the property. He stated that he is uncomfortable with having the shed along the fence given that the fence has a lattice top and the top windows. He suggested the applicant using the wall of the raised plant bed as one of the walls for the shed.

Ms. Herbert asked for the dimensions of the existing shed.

Mr. Wang Bedell responded that it is 8' wide by 5' toward the patio.

Ms. Herbert if it would be possible to construct the shed next to the existing shed.

Mr. Wang Bedell responded that there is only 1' between the shed and the stone wall.

Ms. Herbert stated that the Commission may need more information on the design as well as a site visit to see the existing conditions. The commission needs drawings of the footprint as well as a site plan showing the existing structures. The roof should be 3-tab to match the house.

Mr. Spang stated that around the neighborhood there are some summer porches and greenhouses that the applicant may look at. There are old fashion wooden storm windows with muntins that would make the shed look more finished and could be removed in the winter.

VOTE: *Mr. Spang made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

The Commission and applicant agreed to view the property on Monday August 10th 7:00PM.

Congress St./ Ward St & Congress St/Dow St Apartments

The North Shore CDC requested a letter of support for their application for Massachusetts Rehabilitation Tax Credits.

VOTE: *Ms. McCrea made a motion to approve the letter of support. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

5 Broad Street

The City of Salem submitted an application for a Certificate of Non-Applicability to make in-kind repairs to the EPDM roof.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 8/5/15
- Photographs

VOTE: *Mr. Cutting, made a motion to approve the application, as submitted. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

88 Federal Street

John Lander submitted a Certificate of Non-Applicability to rebuild the rear stone wall in-kind. The wall is currently bulging. The existing stones will be used for the rebuild.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 8/5/15
- Photographs

VOTE: *Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve the application, as submitted. Ms. Turiel seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

Other Business

Correspondence

The Commission discussed the meeting procedures that were distributed by email.

VOTE: *There being no further business, Ms. Bellin made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor, and the motion so carried.*

Respectfully submitted,

Natalie BL Lovett
Community Development Planner