

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
April 6, 2022

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, April 6, 2022 at 6:00pm via **Zoom Virtual Meeting**. Present were: Rebecca English, Jamie Graham, Vijay Joyce, Milo Martinez, Mark Meche, Mark Pattison, Larry Spang (Chair). Patti Kelleher (staff). Not present: Reed Cutting.

85 Memorial Drive/Camp Naumkeag

The City of Salem provided updates on the project at Camp Naumkeag which is currently in a demolition delay, and requested comment on scope of information to be submitted in response to the delay.

Patricia O'Brien, Executive Director of Parks, Recreation and Community Services, Elizabeth Petersen, Director of the Witch House and Pioneer Village, and project consultant Margaret Wood, Anser Associates, were present.

Ms. Wood provided a brief background on the project and noted that this was the project's sixth visit to the Historic Commission. Camp Naumkeag has been requested to be demolished by City of Salem. A structural review of the Naumkeag buildings was carried out by Structures North; indicated that original buildings were built without real foundations because they were seasonal. Demo delay process was begun in January 2022. The City is proposing to move Pioneer Village structures in Forest River Park to land immediately adjacent to where Camp Naumkeag is; Naumkeag would become entry point to new development of Pioneer Village.

Ms. O'Brien noted the City's desire to know if the proposed list of documentation to be provided to the Historic Commission was satisfactory. Ms. O'Brien wanted the Commission to be aware of budget associated with this documentation preparation. Chair Spang noted that Commission members have been out to visit Naumkeag site on past occasion. Ms. Wood noted that the question came up as to whether relocating Pioneer Village buildings is considered to be demolition; would need to reach out to MHC for guidance. Ms. Wood noted that the team was also looking into precedents of other relocated historic buildings in Salem. For instance, buildings in precinct of House of Seven Gables were moved to the Gables campus to create a cultural district. Chair Spang noted that the new demo delay ordinance does feature the word "remove," thus suggesting that removal/moving of buildings is open to interpretation. Chair Spang thanked Ms. Wood for the structural report on behalf of members of the public who had requested such documentation. Preserving the building would entail rebuilding them nearly entirely, thus prompting the question of whether this would constitute preservation or re-creation. Chair Spang solicited Commission members for questions about the report. Mr. Joyce asked if building elevation drawings were available, which were not in the report. Ms. Wood noted that drawings were likely not made when these buildings were built. Mr. Joyce noted that in the past the Commission had received drawings of elevations featuring dimensions for documentation purposes. Mr. Meche supported this view. Ms. Wood was desirous of a single set of questions moving forward so that the City can proceed. Ms. O'Brien wanted to know the Commission's thoughts on the proposed list, as well as what more would be required to request the demo delay waiver. Mr. Meche expressed desire to know more about the intent to preserve and reflect history of the site.

Public comment:

Joyce Kenney noted that Camp Naumkeag hosted a special needs cookout nearly every summer. YMCA also ran a day camp at the site.

Christopher Patzke, Lafayette Street, cited need for at least four additional requirements for City, noting that intent of demo delay is to find alternative solutions and provide time for public discussion of historically significant sites. Nothing in the proposed list discusses the City's intention to provide alternatives. Keep items intact, follow common professional preservation guidelines. All of this can be achieved, in Patzke's professional opinion. The Secretary Standards includes spaces and spatial relationships; the landscape and the site are just as important as buildings; noted that this is echoed in the demo delay ordinance. The Commission should require a cultural landscape report which is the professional standard for documenting such sites for Camp Naumkeag and Pioneer Village. Mr. Patzke also noted that the Commission should require a structural report for buildings at Pioneer Village. In the mid-1980s the Commission determined that Pioneer Village is a significant historical site; per the demo delay ordinance the Commission should require a separate application for demo delay for Pioneer Village. Mr. Patzke also noted that the creation of the House of Seven Gables district should not be used as a precedent given that this work was done prior to establishment of current best practices for preservation. Mr. Patzke also expressed that budget is no excuse for destroying historically significant sites. Mr. Patzke also recommended that interested members of the public visit the Saving Our Heritage Facebook page.

Ms. Kelleher asked Ms. Wood if the City would prefer to have a vote on the proposed list in order to codify the list of requirements. Ms. Wood noted that since MHC will be consulted; it may be easier for MHC to determine if cultural landscape report is desired. If one is wanted for Camp Naumkeag, Ms. Wood identified the need for this requirement as soon as possible. Mr. Martinez noted that landscapes are outside of the Commission's purview and does not believe that Commission has power to request landscape reports, while one would nonetheless be appreciated if produced.

Mr. Pattison asked if historic landscapes are within Commission's purview. As a regulatory board, Ms. Kelleher noted that the Commission is focused on buildings; however as an historical commission they can look at protection, preservation of historic and cultural resources throughout the city; more of advocacy than regulatory role. Cultural landscape report looks at site holistically; inventory form is primarily on buildings.

Mr. Joyce noted that the Commission had discussed elements of a cultural landscape report such as site history, history of conditions, analysis/evaluation, treatment, and record of treatment – all of which are flagged on the National Park Service website. Mr. Meche also noted that archaeology may be included in cultural landscape reports. Mr. Meche made a minor request that information is delivered to Commission following Ms. Wood's meeting with MHC.

Ms. Wood noted that work still needs to be done in terms of how to move buildings, what materials to use, and so forth. Ms. Wood noted that a website was created to have a record of design presentations and transparency as to the progress of the development. SHC is currently sharing the list presented.

9 Cambridge Street—continuation

Elisa and Nicolaus Hofmeester submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a chimney vent.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 2/22/22
- Powerpoint presentation
- Documentation

The applicants noted the home's location right next to Hamilton Hall. A round aluminum silver termination cap was previously proposed for chimney. Mr. Hofmeester noted that the chimney is blocked by houses on Cambridge St.; the cap can be seen from one driveway on Broad St.; Summer St. offers a very obscured view through trees where chimney can be seen; from Chestnut Street the cap is blocked by all houses and Hamilton Hall. The chimney cap can be seen from corner of Chestnut and Cambridge. Installers from Yankee Fireplace in Middleton were consulted as well as manufacturer of cap. During the first meeting, questions were raised which the applicants addressed in a slide show presentation as follows: venting straight out wall (not possible/allowed for fireplace insert; has to be vented out straight through existing chimney; minimum vertical vent height 10ft; cannot vent horizontally; fireplace is in the middle of room); vent through roof behind chimney (not possible for exhaust of insert); does the cap spin (this particular cap is fixed and does not spin); are there other termination cap design options (yes; square cap available in matte black and copper; aluminum one can be painted; both are a bit over foot high; close to 11" for square cap and 10.5" for round; images were shown); enclose cap with brick work (chimney work is not optimal; due to chimney width, extensive brick work would be required; 2 ft clearance above termination cap required; considerably more visible throughout neighborhood; also expensive). Applicants searched neighborhood to look at termination caps, noting a variety of so-called squirrel cages and metal termination caps. Applicants are proposing a silver or black round termination cap or black or copper square termination cap. Applicants expressed preference for black cap. Ms. Hofmeester noted that an inspector had come to the house to advise.

Chair Spang was interested in the square box and extending the chimney upwards; surrounding on left and right with brick pillars and then a stone over the top. Chair Spang inquired as to whether a one foot clearance would be needed if the stone was not combustible. Mr. Meche asked if the copper would stay copper or would patina. Mr. Meche stated preference to black, as well as patina copper. Ms. Kelleher wondered how a brick cap would relate to the actual chimney which has a corbelled feature. Mr. Joyce was also in favor of square in terms of not being a wholly different shape to chimney; as well as squirrel cages that are used elsewhere.

Public comment:

Joyce Kenney expressed recommendation for black cap.

Mr. Martinez commended the applicants for a very comprehensive proposal. Ms. Kelleher requested ability to use these application materials as a reference point for other applicants.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez motioned to approve the application for a square black terminating cap for gas fireplace insert. Mr. Meche seconded the motion. Roll Call: Martinez, Joyce, Meche, Graham, Pattison, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

393 Essex Street—continuation

Carling Audette submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors.

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant requested a continuation.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez motioned to continue the application to following meeting. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. Roll Call: Martinez, Joyce, Meche, Graham, Pattison, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

2 Oliver Street—continuation

Review of detailed plans per Certificate of Appropriateness/Conceptual Approval issued September 1, 2021.

A vote was not taken given that this application was less of a public hearing and more of a review/update process.

42 Warren Street

Abby Conway submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint downspouts.

Ms. Kelleher reported that this request was reviewed under a minor change category and since no abutter objections were received, a Certificate of Appropriateness was issued.

5 Broad Street

Charing Cross Realty requested comment under the Municipal & Religious Building Reuse Ordinance.

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant received conceptual approval for reuse of former school building/senior center, and were to return to Commission for final detail approval. In the meantime, they are before the Planning Board for review pursuing approval through new municipal and religious reuse ordinance that allows former such buildings to be adapted into multi-unit buildings that may not comply with underlying zoning. As part of that ordinance, the Historical Commission and the DRB provide comments to the Planning Board. This is an unusual circumstance as it is in a historic district and conceptual approval has already been granted. Ms. Kelleher asked Commission as to the desire to add any review comments beyond what was discussed in the conceptual approval. Mr. Meche wanted to

ensure that the conceptual review acceptance does not undermine a forthcoming detail review. Ms. Kelleher indicated that Certificate of Appropriateness was issued specifying that applicants would come back before the board at a later date to discuss details.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez motioned to continue the application to following meeting. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. Roll Call: Martinez, Joyce, Meche, Graham, Pattison, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Final Draft Salem Historical Commission Guidelines Notebook

Ms. Kelleher noted significant improvements over initial draft. Graphics are very well-done. Some of the guidelines/language was revised to be more appropriate as to how SHC reviews applications. Information about fiberglass and fiberglass gutters stood out to Ms. Kelleher. She asked Commissioners to let her know if they have concerns prior to publishing the updated guide. Mr. Meche and others discussed visual accessibility in the document. Commission members discussed the need to further review and propose any revisions in order to ensure timely completion of documents. Ms. Kelleher asked that the Commission review design guidelines in particular.

Public comment:

Lev McClain. Ward Councillor, lauded the document in its comprehensiveness, also noting that graphics/photographs would be greatly helpful to community members. The document is still intimidating at over 100 pages in length. Seconded what the Committee had discussed about the need for samples; perhaps as an Appendix or included web links. Mr. McClain also recommended potentially placing summaries of sections at beginnings of chapters rather than at the end. Also cited standards for accessibility of documents.

Ms. Kelleher noted that a likely deadline of April 15 would be established for review and planned revisions.

Salem Brick Coalition/HSI sent a letter that a chapter should be added on paving. The existing guidelines only note items pertaining to paving under "Parking Solutions" which notes that the Commission does not have jurisdiction over paving but can provide guidance.

Other Business

Orne Square Street Lights

Orne Square received Certificate of Appropriateness to install new street lights in 2017. They have asked the Commission to extend the certificate as the one year period has expired.

VOTE: Ms. English made a motion to extend Certificate for one yer. Mr. Meche seconded the motion. Mr. Martinez proposed an amendment to request that Orne Square adjust the color temperature to 2700

Kelvin. Roll Call: Martinez, Joyce, Meche, Graham, Pattison, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Minutes

The meeting minutes for January 5, February 2, and February 16 were reviewed for acceptance.

VOTE: Ms. English made a motion to accept the minutes for January 2, February 2, February 15. Mr. Martinez seconded the motion. Roll Call: Martinez, Joyce, Meche, Graham, Pattison, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Hybrid/In-Person

Ms. Kelleher reported that the City will be moving to in-person meetings beginning July 15th, therefore the Commission will meet in person for their second meeting in July 2022. A virtual meeting option is slated to be available for members of the public.

Adjournment

Mr. Pattison motioned to adjourn. Mr. Martinez seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion so carried.

The meeting adjourned at 8:30PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Dan Graham, Historical Commission Clerk