

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
March 15, 2023

A regular meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, March 15, 2023, at 6:00 pm. **VIRTUAL ZOOM MEETING.** Present were: Rebecca English, Jamie Graham, Vijay Joyce, Mark Meche, Milo Martinez, Kelly Tyler-Lewis. Not present: Reed Cutting, Mark Pattison, Larry Spang

Request for CLG Opinion – National Register Eligibility of Pioneer Village

Ms. Kelleher reported that a proponent submitted a nomination to list Pioneer Village on the National Register. Salem's Historical Commission is a Certified Local Government (CLG) allowing them to provide an opinion on whether the property is eligible for listing in the National Register. An independent preservation consultant was hired to document the property and they provided an eligibility statement saying that Pioneer Village is eligible. Massachusetts Historical Commission's (MHC) opinion has been requested.

Acting-Chair Joyce stated that in his personal opinion, he was in support of recommending that Pioneer Village is eligible as noted in the consultant's report. Ms. English agreed.

Mr. Meche stated that he reviewed the inventory form from 1989, and the reviewer stated that the property wasn't eligible, but that may have been for archaeological reasons. He asked if archeological research has occurred. Ms. Kelleher was unaware of any survey that took place or if any resources had been found. She added that the City did find it ineligible in 1989 due to a lack of integrity and MHC agreed with that determination at the time. More research has been done since and new determinations were made regarding the historic fabric. Mr. Meche suggested that that determination may have been for the entire park. Ms. Kelleher noted that the bathhouse and pool did receive an archaeological review, however, the ballfield, drainage, and parking lot did not.

Mr. Martinez agreed with the current preservation consultant's determination.

Mr. Joyce stated that he was not surprised by the 1980's consideration because not enough time had passed. He noted that there is another living history museum near Bourne, Massachusetts that is on the National Register.

Public Comment:

Christopher Patzke, Lafayette Street. He is the proponent for the National Register, he is happy to see the Commission is in favor of this, and this determination would be meaningful to the city and to him. He provided some comments on integrity from the Keeper of the National Register and would like to speak to the Commission members on how to move forward. He received a response from MHC that provided a path forward to getting the site listed on the National Register. Despite his busy schedule he has poured a great deal of time into his efforts but does need help completing the nomination form.

Lisa Marie Ernst. Stated her support of the property being listed and not wanting to lose another community treasure.

Jessica Herbert, 70 Webb Street. Happy that the commission will support this effort, asked if the consultants could include this task into their scope of work. Pioneer Village should have this designation even if it is moved, because there is a need to emphasize that it is the same and it deserves this recognition and respect.

Ms. Kelly Tyler-Lewis joined the meeting.

Christopher Patzke. Stated that the previous week he found the original blueprint for Pioneer Village in George Francis Dowd's own hand from 1921.

Ms. Tyler-Lewis stated that she too was in support of the nomination.

No one else in the assembly wished to speak.

Acting-Chair Joyce questioned whether the consultants could take over completing the nomination form. Ms. Kelleher replied that the City has always acted as if the site is eligible and does their due diligence for all projects on the property. She noted that it is within the Commission's purview to make that recommendation.

VOTE: English made a motion to find Pioneer Village eligible for listing on the National Register. Meche seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

Mr. Meche asked if the consultant, PAL, completes these types of applications. Ms. Kelleher replied yes, although there is a cost associated that needs to be funded and completing the paperwork can be a daunting process.

Mr. Meche asked if Ch. 30 would be required for public noticing. Ms. Kelleher replied that she would need to investigate the associated rules.

Jessica Herbert, 70 Webb Street. Suggested the consultants may have already started the process. Ms. Kelleher replied that a National Register nomination is significantly more involved, and a lot of documentation and justification is needed, and the comments received by the proponent's letter were extensive.

VOTE: English made a motion that the Salem Historical Commission recommend that the City's independent consultant complete the nomination form. Tyler-Lewis seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

372 Essex Street– continuation

City of Salem/Salem Public Library submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for new accessible book drop structure.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 2/27/23
- Plans by RTG Architects

Ray Geurtin of RTG Architects and Tara Mansfield of Salem Library were present to discuss the project.

Mr. Geurtin stated that the existing drop box doesn't work well as it is 10 steps up, high on the wall, and behind the wood exterior doors when the library is open. They have investigated a drop box to be located at grade, to the left of the ADA basement level entrance ramp. The proposed book drop structure would be 30" x 30" square. There is a 12-inch-high brownstone curbing and 42-inch-high metal fence that they proposed to cut 8 balusters out of to provide 24-hour access. The fence would have a new metal post installed to receive the curve railing section behind the brownstone curbing. The hood would stick out approximately 12-inches, would be placed on a concrete pad, and would be black to match the fence. They would also remove a section of curbing at the ramp and replace it with concrete. The box would be secured at night when the gate is closed.

Acting-Chair Joyce requested the depth of the brownstone curb. Mr. Geurtin replied that the depth was unknown, however, the hood of the box would stick out and be almost flush with the face of the fence.

Ms. English thanked the applicant for tackling the concerns of those with mobility issues like herself.

Mr. Meche replied that the solution is clever but shy of good, the geometry of the curve creates a design challenge, and he suggested matching the latch style of the gate. Mr. Geurtin replied that they wanted the concrete slab flush with the top of the brownstone but that would put the depository too high above grade. Mr. Meche noted that the

fence is more prominent, and the result would look odd, but the fence would be easy to modify. Mr. Guertin stated that the ramp was constructed in the 1990's and the fence installation date is unknown.

Acting-Chair Joyce asked how the other side of the fence would be terminated. Mr. Geurtin replied that they would replicate the three horizontal rails and terminate it into a baluster to close the gap. Acting-Chair Joyce suggested the opening be framed evenly. Mr. Geurtin replied that they didn't want the book drop hitting the inside of the curb. Mr. Meche suggested a short piece of fence under the drop box and keeping the horizontal rails in place. It should come close to the gate post or weld it together. Mr. Geurtin noted that they considered cutting out the top rail only and having the slot in that location. Mr. Meche suggested rotating the drop box slightly for better reach.

Mr. Martinez raised concerns with the hood only acting as a hood and the opening for the drop box being above the box, leaving more than 1-foot of reach up and out. Mr. Geurtin replied that it would be close to 18-inches, and they don't want hood to stick out into the walkway, but he can review the regulations. Mr. Meche noted that the reach allowed is 48-inches-high.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Acting-Chair Joyce suggested that the top rail be eliminated. Mr. Geurtin reviewed the dimensions and believed it would work.

Mr. Martinez suggested using a book drop model that is 2-inches-deeper but with a drop box hole placed further forward that would be easier to reach, the 50-C series. Mr. Geurtin replied that that is the model proposed.

VOTE: Meche made a motion to continue to April 5, 2023. Martinez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: English, Meche, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

15 Cambridge Street – continuation

Jonathan Collins and Kristelle Lavalee submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an EV charging station (after the fact)

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 1/30/23
- Photographs

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant requested to continue to April 5, 2023 meeting.

VOTE: English made a motion to continue to the April 5, 2023 meeting. Martinez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: English, Meche, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

275 Lafayette Street – continuation

MD Property Development LLC submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness - Renovate building and new construction

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/12/22
- Photographs
- Plans by Seger Architects

Daniel Ricciarelli, of Seger Architects was present to discuss the project.

Mr. Ricciarelli stated that he wanted to request a continuance in person and noted that they hope to return for the April 5, 2023 meeting. They had a good ZBA hearing and are at the end of the appeal period and are pushing the design documents forward. They are working with neighbors on the unit count, which is now at 5 units in the new building and 10 in the existing chapel. 1 unit will enter from Summit Avenue and the remainder will enter from Lafayette Street. The proposed building is now flush with neighboring buildings and because of the unit count reduction they need less parking. He will return with conceptual plans. Ms. Kelleher noted that the plans must be submitted by March 20, 2023.

VOTE: English made a motion to continue to April 5, 2023. Martinez seconded the motion.
Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

9 Cambridge Street

Nicolaus and Elisa Hofmeester submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace fence.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 2/20/23
- Photographs

Nicolaus and Elisa Hofmeester were present to discuss the project.

Mr. Hofmeester stated that the existing fence and gate between their house and Hamilton Hall must be rebuilt. It is 35-feet-long and under 4-feet high, but they want the new fence to match the 4-foot height of the neighboring fence at Hamilton Hall. They would also like to replace the 11-foot-wide fence on the other side of their home. They would like to install a new 6-foot-high fence with a curved transitional fence section that ties into the new post. Mrs. Hofmeester noted that the higher fence will provide more privacy from those on the sidewalk, the catering staff, and conceal the trash bins and ladders at Hamilton Hall. She noted that a letter of support was provided by Michael Selbst of Hamilton Hall approving of their proposed plan.

Acting-Chair Joyce asked how large the panels will be. Mrs. Hofmeester replied that the panel length is negotiable, although fence panels may come in standard sizes. Mr. Hofmeester added between 6- and 8-feet wide. Acting-Chair Joyce suggested using a full-length size as the first panel to make the transition further away from the street.

Mrs. Hofmeester noted that the replacement gate is minimally used but they'd like to have access. Acting-Chair Joyce asked whether the higher post would hit the window. Mrs. Hofmeester replied that there may be 2-inches of space.

Mr. Martinez requested the proposed paint color. Mrs. Hofmeester replied black to match the color used at Hamilton Hall and are willing to paint over the Hamilton Hall fence boards match.

Mrs. Hofmeester noted that the entire rear yard is fenced in and they want a fence between them and 11 Cambridge which is 5-feet-high, has pickets and an arbor. The fence style and color would be the same.

Acting-Chair Joyce requested the fence distance from sidewalk. Mr. Hofmeester replied 30 to 35-feet-long.

Mr. Martinez suggested the transitional fence section be a straight run to provide more privacy rather than a scoop. Mr. Meche agreed and suggested the post not be proud of the fence and that there only be one post, the one at Hamilton Hall, a taller version of the existing condition. The interior post should not have a cap or be visible from the street.

Ms. English asked if the new fence would be painted black or natural. Mrs. Hofmeester replied natural wood. Ms. English noted that less of the transitional fence would be seen if it were a scoop.

Public Comment:

Ms. Kelleher stated that the following public comment letter was received.

Michael Selbst, Hamilton Hall. They are in support of the project and made several requests.

No one else in the assembly wished to speak.

Ms. Tyler-Lewis asked if the post at the front gate would overlap the storm window on the right and how it would be attached. Ms. Hofmeister replied that they would cut out a portion to allow for some space between them.

Mr. Meche asked if the current gate covers a basement window. Mr. Hofmeister replied no. Mr. Meche suggested the gate rotate slightly to move the post away from the window trim. Acting-Chair Joyce agreed.

Acting-Chair Joyce asked if the downspout would prevent the gate from opening. Mrs. Hofmeister replied that the gate opens inward. Acting-Chair Joyce asked if the gate hardware would be visible.

Mr. Martinez suggested the gate would hit the window and the replacement gate would need to swing out. Mr. Meche suggested installing a smaller gate, an off-set hinge for an in-swinging door or attaching the hinge on the house side of the gate. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that the gate would hit the protruding windowsill or attaching the gate to a half oost that extends far enough away from the house that the gate would not hit the windowsill. Ms. Kelleher suggested a continuation to allow the applicant to investigate gate attachment options.

VOTE: Meche made a motion to continue to the April 7, 2023 meeting. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

Joyce and Meche to visit the site and help with fence details.

Mr. Hofmeister stated that they want to replace two flower boxes and a gate, with the same style fence, only 5-feet-high and to install an arbor. Mrs. Hofmeister added that the arbor would have straight top. Mr. Hofmeister stated that their neighbor provided a letter of support.

Acting-Chair Joyce noted that the same details, fence, post, and caps would be used, the difference is a 3/4-inch gap between the boards. The fence would be painted black and the trellis would be built into the gate. Mr. Meche requested detailed drawings of the fence and gate. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that a curved or flat top arbor would match their late Victorian home.

Mr. Meche noted that fence post vs. boxes are different so they should be mindful of the details. He suggested that with only 11-feet of space, such a small opening between the houses, the arbor and gate be moved to one side and fence on the other. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that the bay window will cut off a view between the houses.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Mr. Martinez requested that the plans to be submitted include board width, gap dimension, and location of posts. Acting-Chair Joyce suggested plan views and specs on the fence and arbor.

VOTE: Martinez made a motion to continue to the meeting on April 5, 2023. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

53 Summer Street

Stacey Norkun submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace skylight, window, and door, and add new skylight

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 2/22/23
- Photographs

Stacey Norkun was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Norkun stated that they are renovating the kitchen and need to shrink the size of the casement window to accommodate the new cabinetry. They will replace the existing steel side door with wood and on the roof, the skylight will be replaced with two new smaller ones.

The kitchen window faces High Street and is a 1990's Brosco window that leaks and doesn't match other windows. 8 years ago, they replaced all of their windows with wood Pella Architect. The kitchen window would shrink in width but get taller in height to align with the other windows. The new window would be a 4 over 4 double-hung to match the existing window arrangement, with new trim and a paint color to match the house.

Mr. Martinez asked in which direction the window would narrow. Ms. Norkun replied that the left side of the window would shrink to the right and the sill height of 45-inches would also match the other windows, while the head height would remain the same. Mr. Meche asked if the new window was tight on all sides and if the frame would sit against the projecting wall. Ms. Norkun replied yes. Acting-Chair Joyce asked if the window trim would be full width. Ms. Norkun replied that it is a flat piece of trim that is slightly shaved with no detail and the new configuration would be symmetrical.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

VOTE: Martinez made a motion to approve changing north facing kitchen window as proposed. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

Ms. Norkun stated that the skylight is too big and minimally visible from the edge of the district. At 21-1/2-inches square, the bottom of the new skylights would remain the same while the top of the skylight would be lower. A second skylight would be installed in the bathroom.

Mr. Meche was in favor of the replacement skylights.

Acting-Chair Joyce requested the skylight color. Ms. Norkun replied that both would be painted black.

Mr. Martinez requested an aerial view showing the location of the new skylights. Ms. Norkun replied that one was submitted.

Ms. Norkun stated that they want to replace the metal side door with a fiberglass door with woodgrain in it and a 9-lite simulated divided lite with raised paneling. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that with the high fence only the top row of windows be visible. Ms. Norkun noted that the door is also covered by a screen door.

Mr. Meche requested the door width. Ms. Norkun replied 30-inches-wide. Mr. Meche noted that the style door is right and suggested a more vertical lite alignment to match the new wind pane configuration. Acting-Chair Joyce requested the door paint color. Ms. Norkun replied C2 Maine with Blackberry trim.

Mr. Martinez asked if the screen door would remain. Ms. Norkun replied yes.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Mr. Martinez stated that the Commission doesn't typically approve this type of door, but it will be well hidden behind a fence.

VOTE: Meche made a motion to approve as submitted with a 9 lite 2 panel fiberglass painted door. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Martin, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

100 Federal Street

Beth Crowley submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to rebuild chimney without exterior parging

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 2/27/23
- Photographs

Beth Crowley was present to discuss the project. Representing other two owners.

Ms. Crowley stated that three masons have looked at the center stack chimney and stated that it is in dire need to replacing. The bricks are loose and there is no mortar holding them together. They hired Gary Clark Masonry, who would reinstall the brick so the chimney matches the neighborhood.

Acting-Chair Joyce agreed with not applying a new parge coat. He asked how much of the chimney would be rebuilt. Ms. Crowley replied from the roofline up, they will need scaffolding and a building permit, and the brick type proposed was submitted. A historical finish, type N is the cement used on historical buildings in Boston. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that sand struck brick or a lot of variation in the color would not be appropriate. Ms. Crowley noted that the chimney would be capped with stainless steel. Acting-Chair Joyce requested specs of the cap, a sample brick. Mr. Meche asked if it is a working chimney. Ms. Crowley replied yes, but it is unlined, contains heat and will be lined.

Mr. Meche suggested the parge coat may have been a repair and there could more details uncovered that should be restored, so it should be documented and rebuilt by the mason. They should also be sensitive to mortar rather than period appropriate. He suggested that more clarity is needed.

Ms. Kelleher suggested approving a rebuild to match existing with commission members to review the dimensions and design. Ms. Crowley noted that their home is the only one on Federal Street with a parge coat.

Acting-Chair Joyce stated that the angles leading up to the cap also need to be matched. Mr. Meche noted that the builder would need to draw the chimney to document it for restoration purposes, including the number of corbels, etc. He also raised concerns with a possible terra cotta cap on top. Acting-Chair Joyce suggested that the chimney may have been adjusted when they added the higher gambrel roof.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Ms. Kelleher suggested deputizing Commission members to assist with the chimney details. Ms. Tyler-Lewis, Acting-Chair Joyce and possibly Mr. Meche to review the chimney plans.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to approve the application with Ms. Tyler-Lewis, Acting-Chair Joyce and possibly Mr. Meche to review the restoration details. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

Other Business:

- a. Meeting Minutes;

VOTE: English made a motion to approve the February 1, 2023 regular meeting minutes. Meche seconded. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

- b. Violations;
- c. Correspondence

Ms. Kelleher stated that Hamilton Hall requested a support letter for their application for CPA funds for exterior repairs.

VOTE: English made a motion to approve providing a support letter for CPA funding. Martinez seconded. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

Request for letter of support for Fort Lee CPA Application

Ms. Kelleher stated that the Commission had submitted a letter of support for the City's previous grant application for a Fort Lee Preservation Plan. Unfortunately, the City did not received the Battlefield Preservation Planning grant. The City is now seeking CPA funds to complete the plan and is asking Commission to submit a new support letter.

Mr. Meche requested the meaning of selective clearing. Ms. Kelleher replied that the neighborhood may not want to restore the clear hillside like from the postcard since what surrounds it is modern growth. The growth closer to the conservation land could remain. Mr. Meche noted that it would provide more visibility for security purposes. Ms. Kelleher stated that she envisions community engagement and with some WWI oak memorial plantings that could be highlighted again. Mr. Meche noted that the site is also an archeological site Ms. Kelleher stated that mountain bikers wore out the paths through the site and controlled burns have been used to keep vegetation at bay. She spoke to the Bike Committee to ask people not to bike through the site. There has been erosion from heavy rains also. This is one of the only remaining earthen forts from the Revolutionary War. Mr. Meche noted architect, Dennis Gray completed a study of this site and that would need to be updated.

VOTE: English made a motion to approve providing a support letter for the CPA application. Meche seconded. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

- d. Other:

Ms. Kelleher stated that she expects the state to approve a 2-year extension on remote meetings. The April 5th 2023 meeting is currently scheduled to be in person, however, a decision by April 3rd would need to be made so a notice could be posted 48 hours prior to the meeting.

Mr. Meche noted talk of tearing down the Mahi Mahi shack. Ms. Kelleher replied that she would look into it.

Adjournment

VOTE: Meche made a motion to adjourn. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Meche, English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

The meeting ended at 8:45PM

Respectfully submitted,

Colleen Brewster
Clerk