

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
January 3, 2024

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, January 3, 2024 at 6:00PM via **Zoom Virtual Meeting**. Present were: Larry Spang (Chair), Mark Meche, Kelly Tyler-Lewis, Vijay Joyce, Milo Martinez, Rebecca English (arrived late). Staff: Patti Kelleher.

56 Washington Square

Duncan Hsu submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a chimney cap.

Ms. Kelleher reported that this application was reviewed under the minor change category. Since no abutter objection was received by December 18, 2023, the Certificate was issued and the public hearing was cancelled.

1 Pickering Street— *Continued discussion of fence design.*

Joseph Locke was present. Mr. Locke submitted a new set of drawings for the meeting. Mr. Locke noted the Warren and Broad St sides of new fence following edge of property in the lot were altered to a more street-facing style rather than a privacy fence. Chair Spang remarked that the section along Broad St near the house was a more decorative, see-through fence, whereas brick pillars would be enclosed with a board fence. Chair Spang noted that these alterations were responsive to past comments on the application from Commission members and members of the public. Chair Spang requested more details on the proposed brick fence submitted, though generally commended the changes. Mr. Martinez also commended the changes, while noting the need for details and consistency in height of fencing. Mr. Martinez also recommended curving fencing to rise up to pillars as was featured in drawings at front entrance of house. Mr. Joyce commented that a new pillar featured in the drawings along the Broad St side and wanted to ensure that it matched existing granite. Mr. Locke noted cost concerns about a granite pillar to match, though was open to matching granite rather than using brick. Mr. Locke noted that three of the four existing pillars are granite.

Public comment:

Danielle Hanrahan, 28 Beckford, noted that this was her first meeting attended for fence design. Commented on large oak trees, which are pushing the fence out. Questioned how the trees would be accommodated in the new design. Chair Spang clarified that the oak trees were on the Warren side of the property. Ms. Hanrahan questioned if the City would allow a slight jutting out into the sidewalk, i.e. reorienting the sidewalk in order to allow for further tree growth.

Mr. Locke noted that the plan was to get as close to the sidewalk as possible and keep the fence looking as straight as possible without disturbing the oak trees. Ms. Tyler-Lewis recommended reaching out to the Salem Tree Commission. Mr. Locke expressed interest in looking into the possibility of reorienting the sidewalk. Chair Spang noted that the DPW is typically involved with sidewalks, and that the Tree Commission could be an advocate. Ms. Kelleher noted that Pamela Hartford, who had previously given public comment on this property, had indicated that she would deliver further feedback to Mr. Locke.

Chair Spang indicated that further information for adding details to submitted plans would be given to Mr. Locke.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce motioned to continue the application to January 17 meeting to allow time for further details in plans. Ms. Tyler-Lewis seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

11 Lynn Street—continuation

Lynn Street Home Trust submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows and door.

Ms. Kelleher reported that the owner asked for a continuation.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce motioned to continue the application to the next meeting. Mr. Martinez seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

10 Broad Street—continuation

Brett McCarty submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for building modifications and door color.

Documents & Exhibits:

- Application: 12/04/23
- Slideshow/photographs

Ms. McCarty was present on the call. A table of proposed projects, statuses, and timing was shown. The projects included attic HVAC system flue; exterior door color; new 200A electric meter; two air conditioning condensers and one mini-split condenser; basement HVAC system flue; and gutters. Chair Spang noted that the first three listed items would be discussed, with the remaining items requiring further attention from the owner prior to discussion. A close-up image of roofline and flue was shown. Chair Spang noted that the flue was relatively obscured from the street and recommended that the flue pipe be lowered slightly if possible. Ms. McCarty showed an image of 13 Cambridge St featuring the same kind of flue jutting out at the street level. Mr. Meche agreed with Chair Spang that the flue is difficult to see, as did Mr. Martinez.

No public comment.

VOTE: Mr. Meche motioned to accept the roof vent as installed. Ms. Tyler-Lewis seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Ms. McCarty presented her proposed colors for doors – all in shades of purple. She noted that the color “Scooter” had been characterized as a more muted and appropriate color by Commission members during site visit. Chair Spang identified Scooter as a purple or plum color which would work well with blue-ish tone of the house.

No public comment.

Mr. Joyce questioned if a sheen on the finish of the paint was specified. Chair Spang indicated that semi-gloss was typical of doors.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce motioned to approve the Scooter color as selected by Commission members in the field in a semi-gloss finish. Mr. Meche seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Discussion shifted to electrical panel. Ms. McCarty showed a photograph of neighbor's meter to indicate proposed placement of meter at 10 Broad. Ms. McCarty noted that the new meter would be painted to match the house. Mr. Meche noted that Ms. McCarty would also need to have a new larger weatherhead installed at top of electrical service. Chair Spang remarked that robust metal boxes are becoming the new norm in electrical service. Ms. McCarty showed a Google Map street view of the proposed placement of meter. Mr. Meche remarked that the proposed location was as likely as good as it was going to be. Mr. Joyce agreed with Mr. Meche and noted that placing utilities on the ell addition of the house was to be expected, though not ideal. Ms. Kelleher identified the shutoff on bottom of electrical service as a requirement for Fire Department to disconnect all electrical service to properties.

No public comment.

VOTE: Mr. Meche made a motion to approve the upgrade to electrical provided it is painted to match body color and is located more or less in existing location, and any abandoned fittings and wirings are removed to the extent that is practical. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce motioned to continue remaining items to February 7 meeting. Ms. Tyler-Lewis seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

174 Federal Street—continuation

Mitchell Blum submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum gutters.

Ms. Kelleher noted that this item was continued from previous meeting due to a clerical error.

Documents & Exhibits:

- Application: 11/18/23
- Slideshow/photographs

Mr. Blum was present. Mr. Blum said that current wood gutters have failed and are causing water to leak onto stairs. Mr. Blum looked into repairs but not many vendors or options, ultimately selecting 6" half-round white aluminum gutters. Mr. Blum noted that white aluminum downspouts already exist on the property. Mr. Blum noted that abutting neighbors at 176 Federal have white aluminum gutters installed. The applicant desired to replace gutters in same exact locations as existing. Mr. Blum noted that gutters will be on sides of house perpendicular to the street, with no gutters on front or back of house. Ms.

Kelleher noted that there was a Certificate for replacement of wood gutters in the property file from 2000. Mr. Blum had surmised the age of failing wood gutters to be seven years. Mr. Joyce clarified that the existing downspouts would remain, which Mr. Blum affirmed. Mr. Joyce noted that historically the rake trim would have extended down and morphed into the eave into a large piece of molding which had been removed from the house at some point.

Mr. Martinez questioned if the half round could be attached to the roofline. Mr. Joyce noted that the roof would have to be cut back slightly in order to do so. Chair Spang showed a Google Map view of the property to clarify recommendations from Mr. Martinez and Mr. Joyce. Mr. Meche was in favor of a site visit, citing importance of clarifying placement of the half round. Chair Spang cited recent applications that had made use of a Duragutter extruded aluminum product, a heavier gauge aluminum. Mr. Joyce clarified that the issue of concern for Commission was to identify how the gutters would be installed, e.g. if massive clips would be used to affix half rounds, if they would be closer to the roof, etc. Mr. Joyce requested that Mr. Blum obtain an installation sheet from Elite Gutters.

No public comment.

VOTE: Mr. Meche motioned to continue application to allow time for site visit. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, English (abstained), Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

94 Federal Street

James Gaull submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a roof vent.

Documents & Exhibits:

- Application: 12/20/23
- Slideshow/photographs

The applicant was not present.

Ms. Tyler-Lewis recused herself from application discussion.

Ms. Kelleher showed application materials, including a 2016 image of house which was white. Ms. Kelleher noted that a previous application had received approval for paint colors. Ms. Kelleher noted that the applicant wished to add a turbine vent to the rear slope of roof next to the chimney stack. An aerial view of planned vent placement was shown. Ms. Kelleher noted that the vent would not straddle the roof, in response to a question from Mr. Joyce. Product specs for Whirlybird Turbine Vent were shown. Mr. Joyce remarked that this type of vent had been approved previously. Ms. Kelleher showed a street view of the property to better indicate planned placement of vent. Chair Spang noted that the roof ridge ran parallel to Federal St. Commission members wished to stipulate that the Whirlybird not be visible over the ridgeline of the roof, otherwise indicating that applicants would need to come before the Commission. Ms. Kelleher noted that applicants did not specify color of vent in response to a question from Chair Spang regarding available options. Ms. Kelleher noted that the Commission typically preferred vents to match color of roof, as best as possible. Chair Spang recommended black or weathered bronze. Commission members expressed preference for weathered bronze.

No public comment.

VOTE: Ms. English motioned to approve application, stipulating that the top of vent not exceed the height of the roof ridge and that it be weathered bronze finish. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis (recused), Martinez, Meche, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Discussion on proposed new policy regarding architectural roof shingles

Ms. Kelleher shared a draft policy statement for a new SHC practice regarding the approval process for architectural roof shingles. Ms. Kelleher clarified that applications would still be presented to the Commission for review, affording opportunity to determine whether the policy would apply. Acceptance of this policy would not result in a blanket approval for future architectural roof shingle applications. Chair Spang noted that abutters would be notified under minor change category to afford forum for any questions or objections. Ms. Kelleher requested the Commission's opinions on approved manufacturers, shingles, and colors. Sample images of various previously approved materials were shown in the proposed documentation. Ms. Kelleher was open to adding photographs of properties where these materials had been approved and installed.

VOTE: Mr. Meche motioned to approve the proposed architectural roof shingle review policy. Ms. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Ms. Kelleher noted that the new documentation would be added to the website. Chair Spang was in favor of alerting roofing contractors to the new documentation to streamline instructions and processes for future applications and installations. Chair Spang also recommended running the new documentation by the City Solicitor to confirm appropriateness. Ms. Kelleher noted that other cities' commissions had utilized similar protocols for qualifying roof shingle applications under minor change categories. Chair Spang recommended adding disclaimer that other shingles could be considered but would require full review of the Commission.

Ms. Kelleher and Chair Spang noted that similar procedures could potentially be implemented in the future for other items such as venting.

Meeting Minutes

Minutes were reviewed for July 19, 2023.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce motioned to approve the minutes. Mr. Meche seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, Tyler-Lewis, Martinez, Meche, English, Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Other Business

Ms. Kelleher reported that a resident has opposed the Commission member Joyce's reappointment, stating that he is not eligible for membership as he no longer lives in Salem. The City Solicitor has rendered an opinion that Historical Commission members are not required to be a Salem resident under the Salem Historical Commission Ordinance or MGL Chapter 40C. She stated that she would forward the opinion to the Commission members and inform them when the reappointment is scheduled for a vote before the City Council.

Ms. Kelleher also reported that Chair Spang has a meeting scheduled with the Mayor regarding Camp Naumkeag and potential opportunities for preserving some of the camp buildings or incorporating design elements in the new visitor center.

Adjournment

VOTE: Mr. Joyce motioned to adjourn. Mr. Meche seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

The meeting adjourned at 7:46PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Dan Graham, Historical Commission Clerk